



TURKISH DENTAL ASSOCIATION

2023 ERO NATIONAL REPORT

COUNTRY : Türkiye
ASSOCIATION : Turkish Dental Association
HEADQUARTER : Ankara / Türkiye
YEAR : 2023

FDI European Regional Organization

National Report 2023

Country : *Türkiye*
Association : *Turkish Dental Association*

Please classify your national report by following subjects:

Changes *in the association and its organization*

The 19th General Ordinary General Assembly of the Turkish Dental Association was held in Ankara **from October 28 – 30, 2002**. A total of 352 delegates were present, and 341 of them participated in the elections. As a result, the following individuals were elected to serve on the 19th Term Board of Directors of Turkish Dental Association.

Turkish Dental Association 19th Term Board of Directors	
A. Tarık İşmen	President
Burak Saran	Vice President
Emel Eroğlu	Secretary-General
Tolga Beray* (Umut Barış Baykara)	Treasurer
A.Selhan Kaya	Member of the Board of Directors
Alper Direk	Member of the Board of Directors
Fatih Güler	Member of the Board of Directors
Gürbüz Eldeniz	Member of the Board of Directors
R. Naim Şenyurt	Member of the Board of Directors
Sarkis Sözkcs*	Member of the Board of Directors
Tolga Kutal	Member of the Board of Directors

*After the resignation of Treasurer Umut Barış Baykara from the Board of Directors, Tolga Beray, a current member of the Board of Directors, has been elected as the new Treasurer. Furthermore, Sarkis Sözkcs a substitute member has been appointed to fill the vacant position left by Tolga Beray on the Board of Directors.

Trends and developments:

In Professional politics

✓ A Lawsuit Has Been Filed Against The Regulation On Private Health Care Institutions Providing Oral And Dental Health Services

On 06.10.2022, the Turkish Dental Association took legal action by filing a lawsuit with the Council of State requesting a stay of execution and the annulment of several provisions of the regulation, citing concerns about its legality.

The Council of State's decision found that the imposition of administrative fines without prior warning to the health institution, as opposed to following the rule set out in the Basic Law, the Basic Services, and the imposition of administrative sanctions for non-compliance with the previously repealed Regulation on Control of Hazardous Wastes, were clearly in violation of the law and would cause irreparable harm if implemented. Therefore, the execution of relevant rules was suspended.

✓ 30,000 Petitions About the Challenges Facing Our Profession and Our Colleagues Was Submitted to the Minister of Health.

More than 30,000 signatures were sent to our association, the Ministry, and the Presidency of the Grand National Assembly of Türkiye through various platforms by the Turkish Dental Association and the Chambers of Dentists. These signatures were collected through a petition campaign launched on Change.org, through petitions with wet signatures from our colleagues and through petitions sent directly to the Presidency of the Grand National Assembly of Türkiye and the Ministry of Health through the TDA website. The purpose of these petitions is to address the increasing problems faced by our profession and our colleagues due to public concerns:

1. Non-Professionals should not be partners of Oral and Dental Health Institutions!
2. People are Toothless Dentists are Jobless! No New Dental Faculty Should Be Opened!
3. Dentists who are retired from SSK (*Social Insurance Institution*) and BAĞKUR (*Social Security Organization for Artisans and the Self-Employed*) should also be received additional payments!
4. Another dentist should be able to work alongside the other dentist.
5. Dentist should be employed in public sector in greater numbers and more widely.
6. Requirements that are not related to the qualified delivery of the service should not be required for the opening of a medical practice.
7. Dentist should be given Green Pasaports
8. Subcontract Dentistry Unacceptable!

“**Our Demands**” petitions outline our main concerns and expectations above were presented to the Minister of Health.

✓ **Judicial Decision: the Advertisement Is Under the Responsibility of the Clinic's Managing Director.**

Upon the determination that the interview given to a magazine by a non-dentist employee of the health institution contained statements aimed at creating demand and unfair competition, the Chamber imposed a disciplinary penalty on the responsible manager of the health institution, but in the lawsuit filed for the cancellation of the transaction, the court determined that the health institution advertised the health institution through the employee of the health institution in the interview and found the disciplinary punishment in accordance with the law..

The decision also emphasizes that the responsible manager is obliged to ensure compliance with the legislation to which the health institution is subject and to carry out the necessary internal audits for this purpose.

✓ **The Fine Against The Dentist Who Did Not Send The Patient Information Was Cancelled**

Upon the entry into force of the Regulation on Private Health Institutions Providing Oral and Dental Health Services, it was requested that patients' personal health data be recorded in the central data recording system of the Ministry of Health.

It was also stated in the Regulation that dentists who do not fulfill this obligation after 01.03.2023 shall be sanctioned with a warning in the first two instances, a fine in the next two instances and a 10-day prohibition of activity in the fifth instance.

The Turkish Dental Association filed a lawsuit with the Council of State for the stay of execution and repeal of the Regulation, stating that keeping all personal health data of patients in a centralized system created/accessed by the Ministry of Health without any limitation is contrary to international conventions, the Constitution and the Law on the Protection of Personal Data.

Although no decision has yet been resolved in this case, the Court canceled the punishment of a dentist in Kocaeli with a warning sanction for not submitting patients' health data.

✓ **The Regulation On The Promotion And Provision Of Information On Health Services Was Published.**

Determination of the basic principles and measures covering the promotion and information activities carried out by all health institutions, organizations, establishments and international health tourism agencies and international health tourism intermediary organizations belonging to healthcare professionals, real and private legal entities providing

healthcare services and operating with a permit, certificate of conformity or license issued by the Ministry of Health in accordance with the relevant legislation, and the promotion and information activities carried out by persons, institutions and organizations that do not have authorization, permission or license in the field of healthcare service delivery.

The Regulation on Promotion and Information Activities in Health Services, which regulates the procedures and principles regarding the supervision of these activities and the sanctions to be imposed, was published.

The Regulation has provided a clear understanding of advertising and definition in our country.

Commissions were established by Provincial Directorates of Health in each province and an important step has been taken to prevent advertising in health.

✓ **Disciplinary Regulation Has Been Amended**

With the regulation amendment;

- Advertisements for the opening of a health institution were limited to one week instead of three times in one month. Considering the ambiguity created by the expression "three times" and the related implementation problems, advertisements are allowed for one week within the first month. Undoubtedly, this promotion is possible through publications being made in accordance with the legislation; otherwise, there is no freedom of advertisement within one week following the opening.
- With a subclause added to Article 8, which lists the acts that require a fine sanction, it is stated that those who work without a work certificate obtained from the relevant authority and those who employ such persons will also be fined. This amendment aims to specially sanction the provision of health services in unlicensed health institutions, as well as the work in these health institutions by persons who do not have the right to work in private health institutions.
- By adding a paragraph to Article 9, which lists the acts that require the sanction of temporary suspension from the profession, it became possible to punish the act of assaulting or sexually harassing colleagues, other healthcare professionals, undergraduate, graduate or speciality dental education students, or patients and their relatives with the sanction of temporary suspension from the profession in accordance with the severity of the act in question.
- Correspondence by registered and reply-paid letter, as well as notifications in accordance with the Notification Law, have been abolished. Instead, all correspondence must be made physically or electronically using any of the shipping methods that are subject to recording from acceptance to delivery. As a result, communication tools such as Registered Electronic Mail (REM), courier services, hand delivery or similar means can be used to correspond securely, quickly and economically, with delivery, information, and documentation functions.

✓ **Dental Codes**

The lack of scientific, ethical and economical studies on the diagnosis and treatment of oral and dental diseases in our country emerged as a major deficiency. **Diagnosis and Treatment Protocols in Dentistry** were published by our Association in 2012 and shared with the relevant public institutions in order to guide dentists in treatment planning and the implementation of appropriate treatment, to use a common language in all health institutions, and to contribute to more precise planning by ensuring that health-related data are obtained accurately

Our Diagnosis and Treatment Protocols Commission finalized an important study titled "**Dental Procedure Codes and Descriptions**" which will unify the procedures included in the oral and dental diseases of the Ministry of Health and Social Security Institution and TDA Medical Examination and Treatment Fee Schedule.

In health and social politics

✓ **The Board of Directors of the Turkish Medical Association Was Removed From Office By A Court Decision**

The Board of Directors of the Turkish Medical Association was removed from office by a court decision on the grounds of a statement made by the president of the Turkish Medical Association.

Our Association has made a statement to the public that it is unacceptable for elected directors to be dismissed from office without any criminal conviction against them, but only because their conduct and statements are not liked by the government, and that we want and hope that this decision, which is contrary to universal law and our simplest written law, will be overturned promptly.

✓ **100th Year of Our Republic**

With the Treaty of Lausanne on July 24, 1923, after the victory of the national struggle, Türkiye gained the title of "Independent State", and at the meeting of the Turkish Grand National Assembly on October 29, 2023, the form of government was accepted as "**Republic**", and "**Mustafa Kemal Atatürk**" was unanimously elected as the first President.

The Republic was proclaimed on October 29, 1923, marking the start of Turkey's progress as a modern nation-state. This proclamation, along with the acceptance of principles such as sovereignty of people, the rule of law, women's rights, equality, and justice, has become a symbol of the Turkish nation's struggle for independence and freedom.

We, as the Turkish Dental Association, participated in the celebrations held with enthusiasm by many institutions, organizations and our people in our country on the 100th anniversary of our Republic with our event on October 26-29, 2023 under the name of 100th Year Congress.

The scientific program of the Congress included 53 conferences, 14 panels, and 19 courses, which were attended by 179 scientists, including 5 foreign experts. Furthermore, 627 oral and poster presentations were made.

The Expodental 2023 exhibition was held from 26 to 29 October 2023 in an exhibition area of 4500 m². 120 companies involved in the production, import and sale of oral and dental health industry and dental materials participated in the exhibition, which was open to visitors for 4 days.

In educational politics

✓ **TDA Academy Activities**

Between September 16, 2022, and December 31, 2022, a total of **348 dentists successfully completed** “the Hybrid (Online & Hands-On) Modular Training Program” offered by TDB Academy.

Throughout the program, **they completed a total of 1383 modules**, 161 of which were hands-on courses.

On December 31, 2022, 88 out of 114 dentists who completed their modular trainings and qualified to attend the hands-on course did so, and the courses were completed in 2023..

MODULE NAME	SUBJECT NAME	INSTRUCTOR NAME-SURNAME	DATE	Number of Participating Dentists
TDM-1: CLINICAL IMPORTANCE OF ENDODONTICS	Rubber Dam Application	Prof. Dr. Sedat Küçükay Doç. Dr. Elif Kalyoncuoğlu Doç. Dr. Ayça Yılmaz	Saturday, March 11, 2023 10:00 - 17:00	16
	Shaping of Root Canals			
	Filling of Root Canals			
TDM-3: FUNDAMENTAL OF SURGERY	Incision and Stitching Techniques with Materials	Prof. Dr. Burak Çankaya	Saturday, April 8, 2023 10:00 - 17:00	10
	Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation	Dr. Öğr. Üyesi A.Tolga Şitilci		
ÇDM-1: BRUXISM AND ITS TREATMENT	Splint Making in Bruxism and Jaw Joint Disorders	Prof. Dr. Hanefi Kurt Prof. Dr. Tonguç Sülün	Sunday, April 16, 2023 10:00 - 17:00	19
ÇDM-2: AESTHETIC APPLICATIONS IN TEETH WITH EXCESSIVE SUBSTANCE LOSS	Composite and Porcelain Inlay, Onlay and Overlay In Which Cases, Should We Make Restorations, With Which Materials and How?	Prof. Dr. Esra Can Eroğlu	Saturday, March 25, 2023 10:00 - 17:00	19
	Post Restorations	Prof. Dr. Sema Belli		
ÇDM-3: MINIMALLY INVASIVE DENTISTRY	Biomimetic Approach and Diastema in Different Clinical Applications, Shape and Volume Anomaly Composite Lamina Veneers	Prof. Dr. Hande Şar Sancaklı	Saturday, March 4, 2023 10:00 - 17:00	24
	MI Applications in Corner Fracture, Tooth Decay, Abrasions	Doç. Dr. Bora Korkut		
	Porcelain Lamina Veneer Construction Technique / Simulation	Prof. Dr. Taner Yücel	Sunday, March 5, 2023 10:00 - 17:00	

✓ **Manpower Planning**

The Ministry of Health and the Council of Higher Education, which was established for the planning of higher education in our country, regrettably do not have a manpower planning in the field of dental education. The future of our professional education is under threat due to the dramatic increase in dental faculties in recent years as a result of the effects of political populism and the lack of faculty members responsible for education.

According to 2023 data, the number of dental faculties in Turkey has increased to 104. According to ÖSYM (*Student Selection and Placement Center*) 2023 Guidelines, the number of faculties admitting students is 91.

The total number of places in these faculties is 8,989. With over 6 thousand graduates every year, the negative consequences of this rapid numerical increase have started to appear as malpractice at different levels in the practical phases of our profession.

Health manpower planning involves recruiting health workers in sufficient quantity, with high quality, and appropriate distribution, timing, and methods to ensure the provision of health services to society both now and in the future.

The actions to be taken in this direction;

- Avoiding the opening of new dental faculties, freezing the existing quotas, and then revising the quotas according to the need and demand,
- In determining the quotas of the Faculty of Dentistry, planning should be made by taking into account the number of faculty members per student, the number of active dental units installed, and ensuring full compliance with all the rules in the Higher Education Council legislation,
- Planning service delivery capacity for dentists who are self-employed based on population distribution and needs,
- Monitoring of the family dentistry model, pilot studies and evaluation of the results were also conveyed to the Ministry of Health and the Council of Higher Education this year.

✓ **Continuing Dental Education Recognition and Creditse (CDE)**

Since 1992, the Continuing Dental Education Recognition and Crediting Directive has been evaluating activities aimed at preventing the loss of knowledge and skills acquired in dental faculties, keeping up with scientific and technological developments in dentistry, and providing more qualified dental services. This directive has been instrumental in ensuring that dental professionals are up-to-date with the latest advancements in the field, and are able to provide the highest quality of care to their patients.

Dentists who take part in local or national activities recognized by the **TDA Continuing Dental Education Supreme Board** have the opportunity to earn up to 80 credits over a period of 4 years and receive the “**CDE Certificate**”. This certificate remains valid for 4 years from the date of issuance.

In 2023, the CDE High Council credited **53 applicants with 768 credit points**. In addition, **16 dentists** completed **80 credits** and were awarded a CDE certificate this year.

With CDE certificates, dentists both ensure that the trainings they have received are registered by TDA and they are eligible for advantageous registration in the Congresses organized by TDA.

While TDA has been in communication with the Ministry of Health regarding the possibility of making post-graduation Continuing Dental Education mandatory, progress has not yet been made.

In the insurance system (incl. the public health insurance and private insurance schemes)

In our country, dental services are provided free of charge by the Social Security Institution. However, due to the pandemic, there has been an increase in private service outsourcing. Our association is raising its voice on every platform to say that it is obligatory for the public sector to outsource services to the private sector according to the current data.

Furthermore, TDA have maintained the provision of private life insurance for Directors of TDA organs and Dental Chambers along with private personal accident and incapacity for work insurance for dentists, which has been available since 2004.

According to this, TDA Board of Directors, Supreme Disciplinary and Auditing Boards are compensated from the budget of TDA with policies that include the amounts determined in case of accident-related medical expenses, death due to natural causes and accidental death.

The Dental Chambers offer daily compensation for up to 200 days per year for unworkable days covered by personal accident and incapacity to work insurance. Additionally, disability and death compensation is provided due to personal accident from membership fees.

✓ **Corporate Dentistry**

In most developed countries, dentistry is practiced primarily as a private practice. In free, pluralistic democratic regimes, the existence of self-regulated professions based on the principle of self-governance contributes significantly to the liberalization of society, provided that there is a sufficient number of public units where standardized health care is made available to patients in an accessible manner.

Self-governance and patient-centred self-employment are both crucial elements of independent dentistry practice. The Turkish Dental Association values and supports practice-based health service delivery in which these characteristics are maintained. Chain dental clinics are providers of oral and dental health services with multiple locations operating under a single brand name, either under one ownership or different ownerships.

- a) It has been noted that the establishment of multiple health institutions under a single ownership may potentially conflict with the principle of dentists working in clinics under their management while practising their profession. It could be argued that the professional autonomy of dentists is somewhat restricted in chain health institutions, which may potentially limit their ability to make patient-oriented decisions that are in the best interest of their patients.
- b) Identification of health institutions, each of which belongs to different dentists, under the same brand, and use of the name right is also a different manifestation of chain health institutions. In this chain, although each health facility operates in its own autonomy, each health facility appears to be part of a larger entity, with various associations ranging from the name of the workplace to its organization, from the determination of the tools used to the collective accounting.

In this way, a perception is created in the eyes of the patient that support can be obtained from large, corporate, multi-location health institutions in favor of chain health institutions, to the detriment of colleagues who provide services in their practice or in the clinic they open with their colleagues.

The existence and expansion of chain health institutions, where professional autonomy is restricted, and the narrowing of areas of activity for members of the profession due to financial power, are not viewed positively by professional organizations.

✓ **Problems with The Dental Chains**

The main problems caused by chain dental clinics can be listed as the pressure on employees to perform and the possible loss of quality in health services and the violation of ethical rules, especially regarding promotion.

✓ **Possible Solutions**

If it is not possible to completely prevent chain health institutions, then all partners should be dentists and all dentists working in the health institutions in question should be partners of the health institution. Sanctions for violations of ethical rules should be determined proportionally to the number of dentists working in all health institutions with the same name.

✓ **Changes in Fees:**

The Board of Directors approved the 'Oral and Dental Health Examination and Treatment Fee Tariff' to be used by dentists nationwide in 2023 during their meeting on December 14-15, 2022. The approved tariff has been sent to the Ministry of Health for information.

During this period, the exchange rate increased due to the import of materials used in dental services, and other service costs rose due to high inflation. As a result, the Oral and Dental Health Examination and Treatment Fee Tariff, which is typically updated once a year, was updated twice in January and August 2023.

Information regarding promotion of the World Oral Health Day:

- Press Conference;
- The community oral health activities to be organized by local Dental Chambers;
- Sharing FDI brochures via website and social media.

Further information (activities):

27th Turkish Dental Association International Dental Congress

TDB 27th International Dental Congress was held on October 26 - 29, 2023 at ATO Congress Center in Ankara.

In the scientific program of the Congress; 53 conferences, 14 panels and 19 courses were attended by 179 scientists, 5 of whom were foreign experts in their fields. In addition, 627 oral presentations and poster presentations were made.

The Expodental 2023 Fair, which was held on a 4500 m² exhibition area with the participation of 120 companies engaged in the production, import and sales of oral and dental health industry and dental materials, was open to visitors for 4 days between October 26-29, 2023. Expodental 2023 brought together the latest technology products with our colleagues at attractive prices.

In the workshop organized before the congress, a 2-day meeting was held to discuss the problems of the profession and our colleagues.

FDI European Regional Organization (ERO) 2023 Spring Term, Plenary Session

The ERO Plenary Session, which our Association hosted in 1997 and 2008, was held for the third time this year in Istanbul on April 28-29, 2023.

A total of 86 Delegates from 25 Dental Associations attended the ERO Plenary Session, which included meetings of the ERO Working Groups as well as a joint workshop entitled “FDI and ERO Advocacy for Vision 2030”

At the ERO Plenary Session, FDI Former President Prof. Ihsane Ben Yahya, ERO President Dr. Simona Dianiskova, ERO President-Elect Edoardo Cavelle, ERO Secretary-General Prof. Dr. Taner Yücel and ERO Board Members, TDA President A. Tarık İşmen, TDB President A. Tarık İşmen, TDA Board of Directors Member Tolga Kutal, Turkish Dental Association ERO delegates Prof. Dr. Nermin Tarhan, Prof. Dr. Hande Şar Sancaklı, Assist. Prof. Duygu İlhan, Dr. Uğur Ergin and Dr. Yaprak Kalkan and other members of the Foreign Affairs Committee.

February 6 Earthquake and Related Activities

On Monday, February 6, 2023, at 04.17 am and 13.24 am, at magnitudes of 7.7 and 7.6, the earthquake disaster of the century, which is defined as "the earthquake disaster of the century", affected 11 provinces (Kahramanmaraş, Hatay, Elazığ, Gaziantep, Malatya, Adana, Adıyaman, Diyarbakır, Osmaniye, Kilis and Şanlıurfa) with a total population of 13,421,699 in a wide geography and caused a huge destruction in an area of 350,000 km².

This earthquake caused significant destruction in our country and resulted in a high loss of life. According to experts, it is considered one of the deadliest earthquakes worldwide since the 2010 Haiti earthquake, and it was even more destructive than the 1939 dated earthquake in Erzincan.

Immediately after the earthquake, Turkish Dental Association met online on February 6, 2023 at 11:00 am TR time and evaluated what could be done in earthquake zones. To that end, an account for donations was opened and announced to our colleagues via SMS by evaluating what could be done for the earthquake. In addition, a WhatsApp line titled "BOD-Presidents of the Chambers in Earthquake Regions" and "Crisis Management" was established to ensure continuous communication with the earthquake-affected area.

A team was established at TDA Headquarters to forward the requests for assistance from the earthquake zone regarding our colleagues and dental faculty students to our the Board of Directors members and TDA through various channels to the responsible authorities and nearly 200 notifications were forwarded to the authorities.

On February 10, 2023, a request was made to share TDA bank account information on FDI and ERO web pages. Subsequently, FDI and ERO called for international donations to aid in earthquake relief efforts.

Initially, field assessments were conducted to address the basic needs of our colleagues affected by the earthquake, and concerted efforts were made to provide oral and dental health services to the citizens of the affected region, while coordinating initiatives to facilitate the ability of our colleagues to continue their professional activities.

TDB Board of Directors members regularly worked in the earthquake zone.

The inclusion of mobile health services in the "Community Oral and Dental Health Support Work Plan" has been approved by the Ministry of Health. As part of this initiative, 192 dentists were selected from a pool of 589 volunteer applicants from across the country to provide dental services in the region over a period of 9 weeks.

Especially in the provinces of Adıyaman, Hatay, Kahramanmaraş and Malatya, where the devastation was the most severe, USD 464.025.USD cash aid was provided to 388 dentists, including the owners and employees of destroyed, heavily and moderately damaged practices.

The salaries and insurance contributions of the employees of the Dental Chambers in these provinces are covered by Turkish Dental Association starting from February/2023 until June/2024. Due to the demolition of the Chamber buildings, container offices were established for these Chambers, furnished, furnished with computers and other equipment, and their activities were ensured to continue uninterruptedly. Container dental practice areas were established in the region, and the victimization of patients by more than one dentist working in the same container was prevented.

In addition to dentists, assistance consisting of underwear amounting to USD 10,778 was provided to the people of the earthquake-stricken region.

17 students from dental faculties in the earthquake zone have started to receive scholarships for the duration of their education.

What are your 3 Main Concerns?

- The opening of more faculties than are needed, the constant raising of quotas, and thus the enrolment of more students than are needed, and the unemployment or cheap labour process that may result.
- Non-professionals Becoming Partners in Oral and Dental Health Institutions
- Dentists' salaries are not sufficient to sustain their lives in prosperity when they retire.