Analysis of the relationship between National Dental Associations (NDAs) and dental faculties within the ERO zone (Phase-1)

(a NDA-perspective)
Thank you..

Austria
Croatia - CRD
Czech Republic
Cyprus
Denmark
Estonia
France
Georgia

Italy - AIO
Israel
Kyrgyz Republic
Netherlands
Poland
Portugal
Romania

Russia
Slovakia
Slovenia
Spain
Switzerland
Turkey
Uzbekistan
22/37  59.45%
Cyprus -21
wording – as on the questionnaire

only simple syntax errors corrected
Question 1. How would you consider the frequency of your relationship with the dental faculties in your country?
Question 2. Are you involved in development of undergraduate dental curriculum?

Yes 52%
No 48%
Question 2. Are you involved in development of undergraduate dental curriculum? If yes, please specify..
Only as **consultation** – when changes are proposed - **Austria**

I am **responsible** for the curriculum **myself** - **Estonia**

As a chair of Stomatological and Maxillo-facial Surgery department in Tbilisi State University I am **directly participating** in creation of dental curriculum - **Georgia**

Association is invited to a **hearing**, but does not directly influence any decision- **Italy**
We have **bilateral discussions** to choose topics that interest our members - **Israel**

Raamplan Tandheelkunde 2008 (**Profile and Competences of Dentist**) (Dutch education 6 years) - **Netherlands**

Most of the **scientific members of the university are also members of** Polish Dental Society - **Poland**
1) the **discussion of the student educational programs**; 2) the participation in the **standart development for dental speciality**; 3) the carrying out of the **student Olympiads**; 4) the **student participation in** the arrangements of the Russian Dental Association - **Russia**

We can make **proposals**- **Switzerland**

By **student club activities**, and **by meetings with the deans of the universities** - **Turkey**

Participation in **scientific conference**, organization of **lectures** of prominent foreign scientists- **Uzbekistan**
Question 2. How would you consider your relationship in this area?

- Excellent: 25%
- Good: 17%
- Average: 33%
- Poor: 25%
- >1/3: 58%
- 1/4: 17%
Question 3. Are you involved in planning of continuing dental education?

- Yes: 89%
- No: 11%
Question 3. Are you involved in planning of continuing dental education? If yes, please specify.
The **Austrian Dental Law** says that the Austrian Dental Chamber has **the competence to organise the continuing education** of dentists - **Austria**

Organising **courses, conferences** etc. - **Croatia**

The system of **continuing dental education** is delivered mainly **by Czech Dental Chamber** (CSK), but also other providers can take part in the system. There are organised theoretical & practical lectures. – **Czech Republic**

Planning myself university based programme. - **Estonia**
The **ADF is co-founder and member** of the CNFCO (*Conseil National de la Formation Continue*), **the French National Council for Continuing Dental Education**, i.e. the official organisation that manages CDE for the Ministry of Health - **France**

As a program director of Residency in Prosthodontics I have a **direct connection** in the process of postgraduate education program formation - **Georgia**
The Italian Dental Association, AIO has been involved from the very first moment into the National CE Program launched by the Italian Ministry of Health (since 2002). Very early AIO has developed to the most important Provider in dentistry (see also presentation at the ERO Plenary session in Oporto, Portugal 2006). AIO has become one out of two National Providers once the experimental phase of five years had finished. AIO has further developed its goal to provide CE all over Italy for reasonable costs respecting rigorously the sponsor’s clause. AIO’s outstanding collaboration with the Ministry has been rewarded with being the only fully accredited provider in dentistry entrusted even with the assignment of CE credits. Italy

We have bilateral discussions to choose topics that interest our members- Israel
Congresses and seminars of SAKR – are proved as a part of continuing dental education. Dentists can collect an hours of participation - Kyrgiz Republic

Number of students, duration of the dental education. - Netherlands

Most of the scientific members of the university are also members of Polish Dental Society - Poland
National dental congress, regional CDE lectures, regional symposiums, regional conferences, county CDE meetings - Romania

There is the Section of the continuing dental education in the Russian Dental Association. The Head of this Section is Prof. S.I. Abakarov. - Russia

The Chamber organizes, controls and evaluates the continuing education of dentists - Slovakia
Each year we organise workshop “From practice to practice” for dentists - Slovenia

In Spain we do not have compulsory continuing education. In this way, any society, university, clinic or association can organise their own courses - Spain

In Switzerland it is an open market - Switzerland
Continuing Dental Education points and certificates are given to the dentists. Under the umbrella of Turkish Dental Association is there a Board of Continuing Dental education available. - Turkey

Recommendation for excellent students to postgraduate education, “Ibn Sinos” scholarschip.- Uzbekistan
Question 3. How would you consider your relationship in this area?

- Excellent: 24%
- Good: 47%
- Average: 23%
- Poor: 6%
- > 1/4: 29%
- 71%
Question 4. Are you involved in provision of continuing dental education?
**Question 4.** Are you involved in the provision of continuing dental education? If yes, please specify.
Especially our regional chambers organise a lot of events concerning continuing education - Austria

Organising courses, conferences etc.. - Croatia
The result of the CSK continuing postgraduate education cycle is a 
Certificate of Proficiency, issued by the CSK; 
Dentist Practitioner with Certificate of Proficiency, 
Dentist Practitioner with a Certificate of Proficiency in Periodontology, 
Dentist Practitioner with a Certificate of Proficiency in Oral Surgery, 
Dentist Practitioner with a Certificate of Proficiency in Paediatric dentistry, 
Dentist holding a Certificate of Proficiency in Orthodontics, The Certificate of 
Proficiency is evidence of the education of the dentist, for patients. 
The attendance of dentists on recommended practice-oriented courses 
or theoretical lectures is evaluated by credits. The participant in continuing postgraduate education can receive the 
Certificate if the required amount of credits and the prescribed spectrum of educational actions, during two years, is fulfilled. The Certificate is valid usually for 3 to 5 years – it can be then repeated, if the conditions of postgraduate education are fulfilled – Czech Republic
Lecturing myself - Estonia

The ADF organises an annual 5-day Dental Conference and Exhibition every November (see www.adf.asso.fr); provides over 60 free on-line Continuing Education modules (www.adfcongres.com), broadcasts a free and interactive Internet Newscast that deals with topical issues relating to the professional environment of the dentist, as well as a fully commented two-hour long Clinical demonstration (www.jtafd.fr); every year publishes five new booklets on new materials, new technologies, the work environment... - France.

In dental clinic I am a supervisor of residency in prosthontics. In the same I am an organizer of international dental congresses under the aegis of FDI CE Program - Georgia.
The Italian Dental Association, AIO has been involved from the very first moment into the National CE Program launched by the Italian Ministry of Health (since 2002). Very early AIO has developed to the most important Provider in dentistry (see also presentation at the ERO Plenary session in Oporto, Portugal 2006). AIO has become one out of two National Providers once the experimental phase of five years had finished. AIO has further developed its goal to provide CE all over Italy for reasonable costs respecting rigorously the sponsor’s clause. AIO’s outstanding collaboration with the Ministry has been rewarded with being the only fully accredited provider in dentistry entrusted even with the assignment of CE credits. Italy
We arrange **lectures** in our branches (National Scientific Council)- **Israel**

We are involved in provision of **continuing dental education** when we, ourselves provide it. Also by advises to **tutors, lecturers**, who provide it, in case they are authorities of SAKR - **Kyrgyz Republic**

**NMT is in contact with the organisations** the organize the education for the specialist for example oral surgery and orthodontics - **Netherlands**

Our **members are involved in preparing program and it is governmental obligation** that one member must be in the Committee- **Poland**
The RDA works with companies for sponsor’s provision of continuing dental education (equipments, instruments, materials) - Russia

The Chamber may organize continuing education courses alone or in cooperation with dental faculties/universities - Slovakia

Public dental health - Slovenia

The Spanish Dental Association offers bianually a dental congress, online education in our website, and collaborates with the scientific societies (which are a part of the Spanish Dental Association) with their various anual congresses - Spain
Free market, everybody can propose programs - Switzerland

Continuing Dental Education points and certificates are given to the dentists. Under the umbrella of Turkish Dental Association is there a Board of Continuing Dental education available - Turkey
Question 4. How would you consider your relationship in this area?

- Excellent: 21%
- Good: 37%
- Average: 32%
- Poor: 5%
- Very poor: 5%
**Question 5:** Are you involved in negotiations with authorities regarding dental matters and issues?

- Yes: 86%
- No: 14%
Question 5. Are you involved in the negotiations with the authorities regarding dental issues/matters? If yes, please specify..
All Austrian dentists have to be members of the Austrian Dental Chamber by law. Because of this fact Austrian Dental Chamber is the only organisation legitimised to negotiate with the authorities if the interests of dentists as a whole are affected - Austria

Oral healthcare is coordinated by the Czech Dental Chamber (Ceská stomatologická komora –CSK)- the Chamber has negotiations with Ministry of Health, Parliament, Health Insurance Companies, etc – Czech Republic

The ADF participates in negotiations concerning Continuing Dental Education, vocational training, patient safety, prevention, and agreements with the National Health Fund/social security system - France
Trying to improve financing of dental studies, its infrastructure, staff etc - Estonia

I am an **expert of Ministry of Labour**, Health and Social Affairs of Georgia since 2004, 1993-2004 I was chief specialist of same issue - Georgia

The Association participates in **hearings, meetings and expert round tables** - Italy

We are members in advisory committees to the ministry of health - Israel
In several matters- Portugal

National Social Health Insurance House (County branches) - Romania

The RDA involved authorities to carry out of RDA arrangements for the various parts of dental speciality - Russia
The Chamber has a **Committee for Education and a Committee for Dental Practice and one for Legislation**. The members of this committees are observing the political development and creating a professional opinion to dental issues and trying to present it to the authorities - **Slovakia**

Preparation of **national dental health programme** - **Slovenia**

As association we **collaborate with the authorities**, but the final decision belongs to the politicians - **Switzerland**

We are directly involved in **by joint meetings and projects** - **Turkey**
WE HAVE NOT YET REGULAR DENTAL ISSUES/MATTERS – Kyrgyz Republic
**Question 5.** How would you consider your relationship in this area?
Question 6. Are you involved in knowledge transfer?

- Yes: 75%
- No: 25%
**Question 6.** Are you involved in knowledge transfer? If yes, please specify.
Meetings, congresses, web sites, journal, e-mail, SMS network, publishing of dental books – Czech Republic

Many academicians are involved in the work of the ADF - France

As a Full Professor at Tbilisi State University I am transferring the knowledge to undergraduate students and post graduate residents, PhD students - Georgia

National CE program of the Italian Ministry of Health - Italy
We publish **public announcement** and **press notices** - **Israel**

If somebody can speak smth and someone need that information – that means yes – **we involved** - **Kyrgiz Republic**

NMT gives **lecture on the dental faculties** - **Netherlands**

We organize **conferences** and other **meetings** with knowledge transfer - **Poland**
National dental congress, regional CDE lectures, regional symposiums, regional conferences, county CDE meetings - Romania

The carrying out of the scientifical and practical Conferences, Congresses and Symposiums - Russia

mostly in continuing education, but representative of the Chamber are also invited to be part of the commission at specialisation examination - Slovakia

We invite foreign lecturers - Slovenia

Seminar and conference conduction - Uzbekistan
Question 6. How would you consider your relationship in this area?

- Excellent: 20%
- Good: 47%
- Average: 20%
- Poor: 13%

67% of respondents consider their relationship to be Excellent, while 33% consider it to be Poor.
Question 7. Are you involved in implementation of new technologies to practice?
Question 7. Are you involved in the implementation of new technologies in practice? If yes, please specify.
in the way of continuing dental education – Czech Republic

By supplying new technology to teaching, one problem – lack of money – Estonia

If “new technologies” are computer and internet technologies, then the ADF contributes to their implementation in the dental practice through its “Commission informatique”, a working group that deals with the use of dental software and computers in the dental practice - France
In Georgia I am carrying **Master Classes** in the field of Prosthodontics and Implantology and am organizing Master Classes of other professionals from all over the world in different fields of dentistry.

**Georgia**

**AIO has a National Lecturers Board.** Its members are involved in different projects, some together with the universities. **Italy**

We **arrange courses** in concern- **Israel**
Most of new dental technologies are implemented by dental authorities, mostly occupying good level in association Kyrgyz Republic

Supply Information - Netherlands

As Association we promote new technologies - Poland

Joint meetings, conferences together with dental manufacturers & dealers - Romania
The Practical **Seminars, Master-Classes, Exhibitions** - **Russia**

We organize **dental technology exhibition** - **Slovenia**

Through **conventions, courses, organisations and dental magazines** is monitored the progress and this is shared with the members - **Turkey**

Conduction of **exhibition**, invitation of prominent **foreign lecturers**. Every year in common with “Colgate” company conduct the month of “Healthy smile” - **Uzbekistan**
Question 7. How would you consider your relationship in this area?

- Excellent: 14%
- Very poor: 7%
- Poor: 7%
- Average: 15%
- Good: 57%
- >1/3: 14%
- 71%
Question 8: Are you involved in improving the national oral health in your country?

Yes
100%
Question 8. Are you involved in the improvement of national oral health? If yes, please specify..
Many of the regional chambers organise special programs concerning oral health either for the whole population or for special needs (e.g. children) - Austria

Indirectly by organising courses, conferences etc. - Croatia

support of preventing programs, in continuing dental education – Czech Republic
Through the UFSBD (Union française pour la Santé bucco-dentaire), one of its member associations, the ADF is involved in the implementation of prevention programmes for all ages (children, teenagers, adults, elderly people) as well as for dependent and/or handicapped persons. - France

Organizing different actions with oral healthcare companies, having TV presentations and providing dental health and publishing scientific papers with media sources– Georgia
Prevention programmes, volunteering in disaster areas (Abruzzo earthquake, Central Italy). – **Italy**

most of new dental health programmes are implementing by dental authorities, mostly occupying good level in association - **Kyrgyz Republic**

Supply Information, Dental child project - **Netherlands**

Promotion with the collaboration with National Chamber - **Poland**

In several oral health issues- **Portugal**
Prevention national program with our sponsor Colgate, regional and county activities - Romania

1) the School Programs of Prophylaxis; 2) the Fluorine Programs of salt and milk; 3) “The world of healthy smiles” Program for children and adults. - Russia

The Prevention Committee of the Chamber deals with the topic of dental prevention. The dental expert of the Health ministry (equivalent to Chief dental officer) is member of the Council of the Chamber - Slovakia
We are organisers of every year competition for clean teeth for all Slovenian primary school pupils - Slovenia

This is our final aim, and most of our activities try to accomplish this aim. We provide continuing education to keep our dentists up to date, we make public health campaigns related to tobacco, oral hygiene, and in some regions we negotiate the oral health assistance with the authorities - Spain

Lobbying on political level - Switzerland

In this regard, we present some projects to the governments. We hold meetings like congress (workshops) and prepare reports. We carry out progressive programs - Turkey
Question 8. How would you consider your relationship in this area?

- Excellent: 10%
- Very poor: 9%
- Poor: 14%
- Average: 10%
- Good: 57%
- >1/3: 23%
- 67%
Question 9. Are you involved in dental workforce issues?

Yes 67%

No 33%
Question 9. Are you involved in dental workforce issues? If yes, please specify..
Austrian Dental Chamber is the Austrian **competent authority** concerning dentistry **and decides who is allowed to practise dentistry and who is not**. We are also part of the **decision process** concerning the **quota for students of dentistry** - Austria

In continuing dental education for the dental team. **The CSK supports the dental faculties in their requirements for better financing toward the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports – Czech Republic**
Being vice-president for the Estonian Dental Association and Head of the Dept of Stomatology at The University of Tartu it is my need and responsibility to analyse these issues. - Estonia

The ADF is actively involved in rethinking and redefining the Dental Team and the role and responsibilities of each of its members. The ADF also conducts work on workforce demographics and the continuity of care - France

As a coordinator of several CPD Programs I am creating a workforce – dental team for implementation of these programs. - Georgia
As members of working committees - Poland

Several issues- Portugal

Proposals for ‘Numerus Clausus’ in dental faculties, volunteering contracts for students & young dentists in dental offices, publishing young dentist articles in our National Magazine ‘Viata Stomatologica’, publishing student articles in our National Magazine ‘Viata Stomatologica’ - Romania

The Chamber keeps the register of dentists and issues licences for dental practitioners - Slovakia
We are responsible for registering the dentist - Spain

Partner in educational programs - Switzerland

In this issues such as the employment and the unemployment of the dentists we do continuous studies and workshops - Turkey
Question 9. How would you consider your relationship in this area?

- **Very poor**: 7%
- **Poor**: 14%
- **Average**: 29%
- **Good**: 36%
- **Excellent**: 7%

50% of respondents gave a rating of 50% for their relationship in this area.
Brief summary – main activities of NDAs within ERO zone
### Main activities of NDAs within the ERO zone

1. **Improvement of national oral health** 100%
2. Provision of CE 90%
3. Planning of CE 89%
4. Negotiations with authorities (economical & political matters) 86%
5. Knowledge transfer 75%
6. Dental workforce issues 67%
7. Implementation of new technologies 62%
8. **Development of undergraduate curriculum** 52%
Question 10. Which areas in their relationship need improvement?

- Planning of CE: 7%
- Planning of undergraduate dental education: 19%
- Economical, political matters: 19%
- Provision of CE: 19%
- Improvement of national oral health: 19%
- Dental workforce issues: 19%
- 17%
Areas in need of improvement

1. Economical, political matters 19%
2. Development of undergraduate curriculum 19%
3. Dental workforce issues 19%
4. Provision of CE 19%
5. Improvement of national oral health 17%
6. Planning of CE 7%
perceived relationship
good + excellent (%)

100 %
perfect

>75%
very good

>50 %
good/satisfactory
good + excellent (%)

100 ..................... 71 ................... 42 ....................0

>50 %

good satisfactory
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&gt;50 % (good/satisfactory)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Planning of CE</td>
<td>71 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implementation of new technologies</td>
<td>71 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Knowledge transfer</td>
<td>67 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Improvement of national oral health</td>
<td>67 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Provision of CE</td>
<td>58 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&lt; 50 % (average – poor)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Dental workforce issues</td>
<td>50 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Negotiations with authorities</td>
<td>44 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Development of undergraduate curriculum</td>
<td>42 %</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Question 11. How would you propose to improve your collaboration with the dental faculties in those areas where improvement is needed? Please specify.
By appointing members of the profession (of the national dental associations) to the governing bodies of universities and by appointing private practitioners to the positions of professor and assistant professor (in France, private practice represents 92% of the dental profession) - France

The problem I have mentioned is correlated to the need of reforms in the Ministry of Labour, Health and Social Affairs in Georgia. – Georgia

It depends on active cooperation of dental faculties management. – Czech Republic
Communication is the magic word; it works excellent with open-minded persons on one and the other side and finishes up with disasters when personal interests prevail.— Italy

By more tightened contacts — Kyrgyz Republic

More (telephone) contact - Netherlands
Preparing mutual working group - Poland

By respecting the constitution, the human rights, professional law and regulations - Romania

The development of the Programs, Attestations Certifications of the specialists and working places - Russia
More collaboration in dental force planning, the number of students intake - **Slovakia**

To **stimulate cooperation with prominent scientists and professors** - **Slovenia**

Regular exchanges - **Switzerland**

It would be improved by **joint meetings** - **Turkey**
**Question 12.** Do NDAs and dental faculties treat each other as partners?
Why not?

100 %
Next steps..
What do NDAs think about their relationship with dental faculties?

Phase 1...

What do dental faculties think about their relationship with NDAs?

😊 ☹️
Questionnaire - *wording* adapted for dental faculties

*Ready* to be sent to dental faculties
We would need the **consent** of member NDAs for sending out this questionnaire.

May we ask if any member NDAs – **not wishing** the questionnaire to be sent to dental faculties in their country – **to inform us**..
Phase 2. Bring the counterparts (partners) together
NDAs & dental faculties meet...

Meeting point  \[\rightarrow\]  ERO web-site
Free discussion platform

Forum

We now have **The Forum**. Technically improving..

**Multipurpose** – other Forum topics, professional debates, etc. ERO Board and the Plenary may decide..
Report (originating from Phase 1 & 2)

Scientific & Professional ERO Session for discussion of the report – In an upcoming ERO plenary

A physical meeting of academicians & practitioners of interest..
Final outcome

Call to action/statement
Final outcome

Call to action/statement
Re-thinking about repeating the questionnaire

Any change in the situation?
Thank you..

Lella, Anna (Poland)

&

Barac Furtinger, Vesna (Croatia)
Cavalle, Edoardo (Italy)
Dianišková, Simona (Slovakia)
Hanson, Stefaan (Belgium)
Hescot, Patrick (France)
Ivanova, Elena (Russia)
Kosenko, Konstantin (Ukraine)
Margevashvilli, Vladimer (Georgia)
Mersel, Alex (Israel)
Thank you..

Lang, Monica

Pertici, Paolo & Cavalle, Edoardo
Thank you..

nyamalik@hacettepe.edu.tr